

Table of contents

Foreword	3
Acknowledgements	5
Executive summary	15
Part 1	23
1 • Introduction	25
What is in this book?	27
2 • Why is variability a challenge?	31
Fluctuating supply	31
Uncertainty	32
When is the balancing challenge greatest?	33
3 • Greater flexibility is the right response	35
What is flexibility?	35
4 • Key distinguishing features of power systems	37
5 • The Flexibility Assessment Method	41
6 • Identifying the flexible resource	43
Dispatchable power plants	43
Energy storage	45
Interconnection for trade with adjacent areas	46
Demand side management and response	47
Comparing areas using the Flexibility Index	48
7 • How much of the flexible resource is available?	51
Dispatchable power plant availability	51
Energy storage availability	52
Interconnection availability	53
Demand side availability	54
Grid strength and intelligence	55
Potential market and operational constraints	58
8 • What are the needs for flexibility?	69
Existing flexibility requirement	69
Additional requirements of VRE	71
9 • Identifying the Present VRE Penetration Potential	77
10 • What is the cost of balancing variable renewable energy?	81
Key drivers of balancing costs	82
Methodology for estimating balancing costs	84
Estimates of balancing costs	84

11 •	Conclusions, recommendations to policy makers and next steps	87
	Conclusions	87
	Recommendations to policy makers	88
	Next steps and further research	90
	Part 2	93
12 •	Case study methodology	95
	The balancing timeframe	95
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	96
	Treatment of flexible resources	99
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	102
	Scoring and weighting of area attributes	104
	Case study results	105
13 •	Great Britain and Ireland area (British Isles)	107
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	107
	Flexible resources	109
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	111
	Area constraints	113
14 •	Spain and Portugal area (Iberian Peninsula)	119
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	119
	Flexible resources	120
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	123
	Area constraints	125
15 •	Mexico	129
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	129
	Flexible resources	130
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	133
	Area constraints	134
16 •	Nordic	137
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	137
	Flexible resources	138
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	141
	Area constraints	143
17 •	Denmark	147
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	147
	Flexible resources	149
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	151
	Area constraints	152
18 •	Japan	157
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	157
	Flexible resources	159
	Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	161
	Area constraints	162
19 •	US West 2017	167
	Flexibility requirement of VRE	167
	Flexible resources	169

Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	171
Area constraints	173
20 • Canada Maritime: the NBSO area.....	177
Flexibility requirement of VRE	177
Flexible resources	178
Flexibility Index and Present VRE Penetration Potential	181
Area constraints	182

Annexes

A • Other integration costs.....	189
B • Additional information on VRE technologies.....	203
C • Assumptions relating to dispatchable power plants in case-study areas	207
D • Defining the power area for analysis with the FAST tool	211
E • The role of CCS in flexible power generation.....	213
F • The role of CHP in flexible power generation.....	215
G • Treatment of fundamental area attributes in the case-studies	217
H • Acronyms.....	221
I • References.....	225

List of figures

ES.1. The FAST Method	17
ES.2. VRE deployment potentials today, from the balancing perspective	18
1. Variable renewable energy shares in ETP BLUE Scenarios (2050)	27
2. System integration challenges	28
3. Variability in demand (upper line), and in net load (lower line) in a challenging week.....	31
4. Overview of flexibility needs and resources	36
5. Key distinguishing attributes of power areas assessed.....	38
6. The FAST Method in a nutshell	41
7. Technical ramping capabilities of power plants in the Nordic power area	44
8. Flexible resource in dispatchable power plants.....	45
9. Flexible resource in storage facilities	46
10. Flexible resource in interconnections.....	46
11. Flexible resource on the demand side	48
12. Flexibility Index calculated for eight case study areas.....	49
13. A fairly generic load curve example.....	51
14. Availability of dispatchable power plants to provide flexibility.....	52
15. Availability of storage facilities.....	53
16. Availability of interconnection capacity.....	54
17. Availability of the demand side.....	55
18. Constraints on availability represented by the grid	56
19. Power system interaction through an intelligent grid.....	57
20. Operational and market constraints on availability	58
21. Balancing areas in the eastern United States in 2007 (left), and assumed in 2024 (right)	59
22. Effect of incentive on available flexible resources in the market place	61
23. Effect of 35% variable renewables in the West Connect area of the United States.....	62
24. Managing uncertainty in the net load	66
25. Existing and additional needs for flexibility	69

26. Hourly up-ramping in load (top) and net load (bottom) in the western United States (MW).....	70
27. Assessing the flexibility requirement of the VRE portfolio.....	71
28. Impact of geographical spread, smoothing PV variability.....	73
29. Impact of complementary VRE output on variability in California, July 2003.....	73
30. Solar and wind resource on a typical December day in the state of Victoria, Australia.....	74
31. VRE potentials today, from the balancing perspective.....	78
32. Global sample of VRE integration studies.....	81
33. Balancing cost savings through operational and market measures.....	83
34. Estimates of wind energy balancing costs.....	85
35. Calculating net technical flexible resource (NTR).....	102
36. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (British Isles).....	108
37. Dispatchable plant portfolio (British Isles).....	109
38. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (British Isles).....	109
39. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (British Isles) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure).....	110
40. Attributes relating to storage availability (British Isles).....	113
41. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (British Isles).....	114
42. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (British Isles).....	115
43. Availability of total flexible resource (British Isles).....	116
44. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (Iberian Peninsula).....	120
45. Dispatchable plant portfolio (Iberian Peninsula).....	121
46. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (Iberian Peninsula).....	121
47. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (Iberian Peninsula) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure).....	122
48. Attributes relating to storage availability (Iberian Peninsula).....	125
49. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (Iberian Peninsula).....	126
50. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (Iberian Peninsula).....	127
51. Availability of total flexible resource (Iberian Peninsula).....	127
52. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (Mexico).....	130
53. Dispatchable plant portfolio (Mexico).....	131
54. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (Mexico).....	131
55. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (Mexico) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure).....	132
56. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (Mexico).....	135
57. Availability of total flexible resource (Mexico).....	136
58. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (Nordic).....	138
59. Dispatchable plant portfolio (Nordic).....	139
60. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (Nordic).....	139
61. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (Nordic) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure).....	140
62. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (Nordic).....	143
63. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (Nordic).....	144
64. Availability of total flexible resource (Nordic).....	145
65. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (Denmark).....	148
66. Dispatchable plant portfolio (Denmark).....	149
67. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (Denmark).....	149
68. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (Denmark) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure).....	150
69. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (Denmark).....	153
70. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (Denmark).....	153

71. Availability of total flexible resource (Denmark)	154
72. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (Japan).....	158
73. Dispatchable plant portfolio (Japan).....	159
74. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (Japan).....	159
75. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (Japan) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure)	160
76. Attributes relating to storage availability (Japan).....	163
77. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (Japan)	164
78. Availability of total flexible resource (Japan).	164
79. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (US West 2017)	168
80. Dispatchable plant portfolio (US West 2017).....	169
81. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (US West 2017).....	169
82. Likely operation of dispatchable plant (US West 2017) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak (bottom figure).....	170
83. Attributes relating to storage availability (US West 2017)	173
84. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (US West 2017)	174
85. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (US West 2017)	175
86. Availability of total flexible resource (US West 2017)	175
87. Attributes relating to VRE flexibility requirement (NBSO)	178
88. Dispatchable plant portfolio (NBSO)	179
89. Technical flexibility of dispatchable plant (NBSO).....	179
90. Likely operation of dispatchable plant types (NBSO) at minimum demand (top figure), and peak demand (bottom figure)	180
91. Attributes relating to demand-side resource availability (NBSO)	183
92. Attributes relating to interconnection availability (NBSO).....	184
93. Availability of total flexible resource (NBSO)	184
A1. An example of a scenario approach to integration cost analysis	190
A2. Capacity credit for wind in selected regions	191
A3. Capacity credit for solar technologies in the Western United States.....	192
A4. Adequacy costs of wind by region (energy normalised approach)	193
A5. Breakeven distances by capacity factor and electricity value.....	196
A6. Scale economies in transmission assuming fixed capacity and distance	197
A7. Transmission costs of wind and system optimisation in the Eastern US	198
A8. Economies of scale (voltage) in EWITS 2010	198
A9. Transmission costs of wind in Europe	199
A10. Total transmission investment in Europe (EWIS)	199
A11. Transmission costs in Europe (GreenNet)	199
A12. Cost of wind transmission in Ireland.....	200
B1. Variability of wind power over different time scales (Ireland, 2005).....	203
B2. Maximum up-ramps of wind (MW/hour) in Finland, 2005-2007	204
B3. Variability of solar PV output over eight sites in California	205
B4. Wind and wave variability correlation	206
D1. Power areas and power systems.....	211

List of tables

1. Average penetrations of wind energy in leading areas, 2009.....	26
2. Flexible resources in the Iberian Peninsula	49
3. Mean errors in wind power forecasts (% of installed wind capacity).....	65
4. Scope of integration cost studies.....	82

5. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants in the British Isles	101
6. FIX values for up-ramping	103
7. FIX values for down-ramping	103
8. VRE portfolio assumptions (British Isles)	107
9. VRE flexibility requirement (British Isles)	107
10. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (British Isles)	111
11. Technical flexible resources (British Isles)	112
12. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (British Isles)	112
13. Present VRE Penetration Potential (British Isles)	112
14. VRE portfolio assumptions (Iberian Peninsula)	119
15. VRE flexibility requirement (Iberian Peninsula)	119
16. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (Iberian Peninsula)	123
17. Technical flexible resources (Iberian Peninsula)	123
18. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (Iberian Peninsula)	124
19. Present VRE Penetration Potential (Iberian Peninsula)	124
20. VRE portfolio assumptions (Mexico)	129
21. VRE flexibility requirement (Mexico)	129
22. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (Mexico)	133
23. Technical flexible resources (Mexico)	133
24. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (Mexico)	134
25. Present VRE Penetration Potential (Mexico)	134
26. VRE portfolio assumptions (Nordic)	137
27. VRE flexibility requirement (Nordic)	137
28. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (Nordic)	141
29. Technical flexible resources (Nordic)	141
30. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (Nordic)	142
31. Present VRE Penetration Potential (Nordic)	142
32. VRE portfolio assumptions (Denmark)	147
33. VRE flexibility requirement (Denmark)	147
34. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (Denmark)	150
35. Technical flexible resources (Denmark)	151
36. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (Denmark)	151
37. Present VRE Penetration Potential (Denmark)	152
38. VRE portfolio assumptions (Japan)	157
39. VRE flexibility requirement (Japan)	158
40. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (Japan)	161
41. Technical flexible resources (Japan)	161
42. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (Japan)	162
43. Present VRE Penetration Potential (Japan)	162
44. VRE portfolio assumptions (US West 2017)	167
45. VRE flexibility requirement (US West 2017)	168
46. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (US West 2017)	171
47. Technical flexible resources (US West 2017)	171
48. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (US West 2017)	172
49. Present VRE Penetration Potential (US West 2017)	172
50. VRE portfolio assumptions (NBSO)	177
51. VRE flexibility requirement (NBSO)	177
52. Technical flexible resource from dispatchable power plants (NBSO)	181
53. Technical flexible resources (NBSO)	181
54. Existing flexibility requirement and Flexibility Index (NBSO)	182

55. Present VRE Penetration Potential (NBSO)	182
A1. Key drivers of adequacy costs	193
A2. Issues requiring regulation	200
A3. Stakeholders in transmission projects	201
G1. Summary of fundamental attributes	220

List of boxes

1. Distributed variable renewables	28
2. Other integration challenges	29
3. Curtailing variable output	35
4. How flexible is nuclear power?	43
5. Dynamic line rating	57
6. Balancing areas	59
7. Power exchanges	60
8. Spanish PV experiences	65